(The American Mathematical Monthly) A decision has been made on your submission

Писем: 2

American Mathematical Monthly <em@editorialmanager.com> 31 декабря 2024 г. в 06:34
Ответить: American Mathematical Monthly <monthly@maa.org>
Кому: Semjon Adlaj <semjonadlaj@gmail.com>

Ref.: Ms. No. MONTHLY-D-24-00974

A hendecagon construction via quintisection
The American Mathematical Monthly

Dear Dr. Adlaj,

I am writing about your paper, "A hendecagon construction via quintisection," which you submitted to The American Mathematical Monthly. I have reviewed your paper and discussed it with members of the Editorial Board.

After careful consideration of your paper and the mix of topics we hope to bring to the Monthly's readers, the Board has decided to reject your manuscript. Here is a summary of the remarks I received on your paper from the Board.

"The Editorial Board refers the author once again to the 1988 Monthly paper [1], which ends with a result of Gauss from 1801, continuing "Thus, ruler, compass, and angle quinsector will suffice to construct a regular 11-gon, 41-gon, or 101-gon." There is little in this manuscript that has not been known for 35+ years.

[1] https://www.jstor.org/stable/2323624 ."

Unfortunately, therefore, we are unable to accept this manuscript for publication.

The decision to reject a manuscript is always difficult. The Monthly receives a large number of submissions each year, and we are able to publish only a small fraction of them. We regret that page limitations force us to turn away many fine papers. You are of course now free to submit the paper elsewhere should you choose to do so.

Your manuscript may be better suited to one of Taylor & Francis' other journals, and the Taylor & Francis editorial team might be in touch with some specific suggestions.

Thank you for submitting your paper to the Monthly. We wish you luck in finding an appropriate journal for the publication of your work.

Yours sincerely,

Della Dumbaugh, Ph.D.
Editor
The American Mathematical Monthly

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Remove my information/details). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Semjon Adlaj <semjonadlaj@gmail.com> 31 декабря 2024 г. в 09:06
Кому: American Mathematical Monthly <monthly@maa.org>

Dear Della:

My brief paper is NOT about the mere possibility of constructing the hendecagon via quintisection which was known to Gauss, as rightfully pointed out by Gleason. My paper provides an EXPLICIT construction via quintisection which was NOT known before the date which I sent my paper to you. In particular, it points out to two concrete values (not known to Gauss), other than the two primes 5 and 11, where square roots must be extracted.

Your citation "Thus, ruler, compass, and angle quinsector will suffice to construct a regular 11-gon" is not only true but reflects a significant misunderstanding on your behalf of my paper which never doubted the existence of such construction. Instead of repeating the existence claim (as you apparently mistakenly perceived my paper to be) it made that construction (which was known to merely exist) explicitly available to the readers.

Have you forwarded my paper to Susan, as I requested? I strongly prefer corresponding with her as I would rather not burden you any further with any discussion. I would merely ask you to forward my paper to Susan, if you have not done so, without necessarily telling me anything more than you already did. The fact that she was the former editor must NOT preclude you from sending my paper directly to her as I initially requested. I am sorry to inform you that the answer which I received from you could have been made much earlier and without your insisting on any bureaucratic procedures.

Kind regards,
https://semjonadlaj.com